Comparative Law in a Global Context

THE LEGAL SYSTEMS OF ASIA AND AFRICA

SECOND EDITION

WERNER MENSKI

CONTENTS

| PART I | Preface and acknowledgments page xi Table of cases xv Table of statutes xvii List of abbreviations xx Comparative framework |
|--------|--|
| | Introduction: Globalisation and Asian and African legal systems 3 |
| 1 | Comparative law and legal theory from a global perspective 25 1.1 The culture-specific nature of law and respect for difference 26 1.2 Changing global scenario: from colonial transplant to ethnic implant 37 1.2.1 International law and its unifying pressures 38 1.2.2 Comparative law as a harmonising handmaiden 46 1.2.3 Assumptions about uniformity: legal transplants and reception of laws 50 1.2.4 Southern voices: from polite silence to post-colonial reassertion 55 1.3 New globalisation: reverse colonisation and ethnic implants 58 1.4 Good practice in studying and teaching comparative law 66 1.5 World legal history: a deficient model 70 1.6 A model of pluralist, globality-conscious legal education 75 |
| 2 | Legal pluralism 82 2.1 Early conceptualisations of legal pluralism 85 2.2 The historical school of law 88 2.3 Early legal pluralism: Ehrlich's 'living law' 92 2.4 Reluctant pluralism: Hart's primary and secondary rules 98 2.5 Postmodern theories of legal pluralism 103 2.5.1 Moore's concept of the 'semi-autonomous' social field 104 2.5.2 Allott's three perspectives on law 108 |

viii CONTENTS

| | 2.5.3 Griffiths' theory of legal pluralism 113 2.5.4 Chiba's tripartite model of law 119 |
|---------|---|
| 3 | Comparative jurisprudence: images and reflections of law 3.1 Traditional natural law theories in outline 131 3.2 Greek legal philosophy 134 3.3 Roman legal philosophy 139 3.4 Early and later medieval developments in Church law 3.5 Re-evaluation of natural law during Renaissance and Reformation 146 |
| | 3.6 Legal positivism 150 3.7 Beyond positivism 160 3.7.1 Socio-legal approaches 161 3.7.2 New natural law theories 168 3.8 A global working definition of law 173 |
| PART II | Regional comparisons in a global context |
| | Introduction 193 |
| 4 | Hindu law: the search for appropriateness 196 4.1 A historical and conceptual overview 200 4.2 The pre-classical stage: Vedic law (c. 1500 BC to c. 500 BC) 204 4.3 Classical Hindu law (c. 500 BC to c. 200 AD) 209 4.4 Late classical Hindu law (c. 500 BC to c. 1100 AD) 222 4.5 Post-classical Hindu law (after 1100) 234 4.6 Medieval Hindu law under Muslim domination 237 |
| | 4.7 Anglo-Hindu law 239 4.8 Modern Hindu family law in India 249 4.9 Hindu legal concepts and the Indian Constitution 259 4.10 Searching for composite appropriateness in postmodernity 273 |
| 5 | Islamic law: God's law or men's law? 279 5.1 Understanding Islamic law from a legal pluralist perspective 281 5.2 The Qur'anic base and its application 289 5.3 The Prophet's roles: leader, judge and guide 294 5.4 Early Islamic law after the Prophet's death 298 5.5 Legal developments in the early Muslim empire: the Umayyads 303 5.6 Scholar-jurists and the Abbasids 309 |
| | 5.7 The central role of jurists 312 5.7.1 Schools of law and competing doctrines 312 5.7.2 Shafi'i scheme to unify Muslim jurisprudence 315 5.7.3 Hadith collections and the 'Schacht controversy' 319 5.8 Continuing diversities after Shafi'i 324 5.9 Judicial administration: qadis and muftis 330 5.10 Subsidiary sources of law 333 |

CONTENTS

| | 5.11 5.12 5.13 5.14 | The purported closing of the 'gates of <i>ijtihad</i> ' 339 The shift towards legal reforms 344 Turkey as a secular Muslim country 354 Pakistani law and Islamisation 364 |
|---|------------------------------|--|
| 6 | Afric | an laws: the search for law 380 The denial of African culture and laws 385 |
| | 6.2 | The search for African law and legal theory 390 |
| | 6.3 | The nature of traditional African laws 404 |
| | | 6.3.1 Reflections of early knowledge 404 |
| | | 6.3.2 African worldviews and their conceptual |
| | | implications 407 |
| | | 6.3.3 African religions and socio-ritual processes 413 |
| | | 6.3.4 African customary law as a self-controlling system 421 |
| | | 6.3.5 Dispute settlement processes in pre-colonial Africa 435 |
| | 6.4 | African laws under colonial rule 444 |
| | | 6.4.1 The process of colonisation 445 |
| | | 6.4.2 The colonial impact on African customary systems 453 |
| | | 6.4.3 The colonial impact on dispute settlement processes 459 |
| | 6.5 | African laws in the post-colonial period 464 |
| | | 6.5.1 The continuing devaluation of African traditions 466 6.5.2 Debates about custom in modern African laws 470 |
| | | |
| | | 6.5.3 Dispute settlement and the problems of finding justice 477 |
| | | A STATE OF THE PARTY OF THE PAR |
| | 6.6 | 6.5.4 The unification debate as a tool for nation-building 480 The future 485 |
| | 0.0 | The future 403 |
| 7 | Chin | ese law: code and conduct 493 |
| | 7.1 | Scholarly representations of Chinese laws 495 |
| | 7.2 | Traditional Chinese worldviews in their social and |
| | | legal context 502 |
| | | 7.2.1 The cosmic dimension: <i>tao</i> 503 |
| | | 7.2.2 Self-controlled order, Chinese style: <i>li</i> 505 |
| | | 7.2.3 The social context of traditional Chinese legal |
| | | regulation 512 |
| | | 7.2.4 The place of customary laws 518 |
| | 7.3 | The classical Chinese legal system: codes and what else? 521 |
| | | 7.3.1 Historical overview of codification in China 521 |
| | | 7.3.2 The conceptual emphasis on penal law 523 |
| | | 7.3.3 The key concept of <i>fa</i> and the influence of legalism 525 |
| | _ | 7.3.4 Confucianisation of the law 531 |
| | 7.4 | 1 11 |
| | | 7.4.1 The imperial code system as a formal framework 535 |
| | | 7.4.2 The Emperor as Son of Heaven 538 |
| | | 7.4.3 The imperial legal machinery 541 |
| | | 7.4.4 Avoidance of the law 547 7.4.5 Social and ritual differentiation in the law 555 |
| | | 7.4.5 Social and ritual differentiation in the law 555 |

X CONTENTS

| 7.5 | Post-imperial Chinese legal systems 560 |
|------|---|
| | 7.5.1 Resistance to modernising reforms 561 |
| | 7.5.2 Introduction of Western laws in the Republican |
| | period 564 |
| | 7.5.3 The communist foundations of Chinese law 566 |
| 7.6 | Law in the People's Republic of China 569 |
| | 7.6.1 The ambivalent approach to law in Mao's China 570 |
| | 7.6.2 The post-Maoist reconstruction of Chinese law 579 |
| | 7.6.3 The new legal structures and the future 584 |
| Cond | clusion: towards global legal realism 594 |
| Refe | rences 614 |
| Inde | |